(A MANUAL FOR INTERNAL) QUALITY ASSURANCE (IQA) IN HIGHER EDUCATION (HE)

with a special focus on Professional Higher Education (PHE)

QA Seminar Vilnius – Plenary Session I
Lucien Bollaert
3 December 2014
• intro
• What is Quality?
• What is QA management? (5 phases)
• TQA from vision, mission & strategy (PHE)
• QA and its stakeholders
• LO, QFs and QA
• QA on programme/course level (PHE)
• Quality Culture
• Conclusions & good practices
Why an IQA manual?

MAP-ESG project: IQA introduced by EQA!

Q, QA & QC are linked, but not one to one

UAS & Business Schools late with QA and often special EQA treatment

Eurashe Erasmus+ funded project

Guidebook with reflections on research results & recommendations before (re)designing IQA
EURASHE’S MANUAL FOR INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE IN PROFESSION-ORIENTED HIGHER EDUCATION

(1st draft)

Eurashe Nicosia Seminar
Lucien Bollaert
27 September 2012
Workshop I.1
MANUAL FOR INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE IN (PROFESSION-ORIENTED) HIGHER EDUCATION

(8th draft)

Eurashe Bucharest Seminar
Lucien Bollaert
24-25 October 2013
Table of contents of IQA manual (1)

- Foreword by prof. Orphanides
- Foreword by prof. Stensaker

0. Introduction

1. What is Quality?
2. Quality of what?
   HE – PHE – Teaching & learning, research, social impact – PHE features

3. Quality & QA
4. QA models & underlying values
Table of contents of IQA manual (2)

5. QA methodology & tools
6. QA development phases
7. QA standards, indicators and criteria
8. QA & ESG
9. IQA & EQA
10. QA & vision, mission and strategy
11. QA of education, research & social services
12. QA & stakeholders
Table of contents of IQA manual (3)
13. QA, qualifications, QFs & LOs
14. LOs, competences & assessment
15. QA procedures, manuals, labels & subject-specific QA
16. QA, rankings & transparancy tools
17. Quality, QA & Quality Culture
18. Conclusions & recommendations
Annex 1 : bibliography
Annex 2 : acronyms & abbreviations
Annex 3 : Eurashe policy paper on QA

- Institutions should have a policy for QA that is made public and…
- forms part of their strategic management.
- Internal stakeholders should develop and…
- implement the policy…
- through appropriate structures and processes, …
- while involving external stakeholders.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q as</th>
<th>concept of Q</th>
<th>QM concept</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Exceptional”</td>
<td>externally recognised as high class excellence</td>
<td>Q control with standards &amp; benchmarking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“perfect or consistent”</td>
<td>focus on process with everybody involved</td>
<td>TQM: process control &amp; assessment training &amp; culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“fit for purpose”</td>
<td>Q is functional customer requirements provider’s needs(mission)</td>
<td>service satisfaction frameworks &amp; PDCA strategic TQM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“value for money”</td>
<td>accountability &amp; effectiveness against cost = efficiency</td>
<td>change &amp; Q competition performance indicators audits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“transforming”</td>
<td>qualitative change</td>
<td>enhancement by empowered participant culture</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harvey & Green (1993), Harvey (1999), Newton (2007)
Quality is the degree to which a product or service meets the expectations or aims the stakeholders require or desire, and the degree to which it gives undisturbed satisfaction during its expected life (Juran (1951, 1999))

Degree: measurable ≠ only quantitative
Product or service: see GATT & EU
Expectations or aims: customer & institution
Stakeholders: internal & external co-creators
Require or desire: practical & cultural
Satisfaction during its expected life: sustainable
• Quality, as defined by its stakeholders, is the added value between input and output

• Excellent output ≠ most added value = improvement = transformation, while still meeting the international minimum standards
Educational Strategic Choice or Reality

- HE a
  - Secondary minimum leaving standards/LO
  - QF minimum standard/LO
- HE b
  - Secondary
- HE c
  - Secondary

Excellence

Secondary

Dirk Van Damme (OECD)
Q is the added value between input & output (via processes)

mission (E/R/SS) | institution’s strategy | results
LO of input | study programme | achieved LO

input | processes | output

added value = transformation

Quality Management

“QA is a management approach to focus on the quality of the organisation and is based on participation of all stakeholders in order to satisfy their expectations and aims as long as possible” (ISO)
IQA manual

mission (E/R/SS)

institution’s strategy

study programme

results

achieved LO

input

processes

output

transformation

using criteria (standards & indicators)

Quality Management (System)

LO of input

tool tool tool tool tool tool

methodology
• **QA methodology & tools**

Deming’s PDCA-cycle

**Tools to measure**: quantitative & qualitative data, KPI analysis, consensus meetings…
• **Standards & indicators**

• **Standard**: a kind of description that describes how the organisation and its people should develop and manage materials, products, services, processes & systems in order to satisfy the needs & expectations of its stakeholders

• **Threshold or excellence** standards?

• **Guideline**: help to explain how processes & procedures should/can be performed in order to meet the standard (good practice)
Standards & indicators

**Indicator**: breaks up standards into measurable and appropriate units in order to measure how much the organisation has achieved or is compliant with the standards.

**Quantitative or qualitative indicators**

Indicators should give information on the organisation’s performance as far as quality of its requirements are concerned and help the organisation to improve its performance.
mission (E/R/SS)  
LO of input  

institution’s strategy  
study programme  

results  
achieved LO  

input  

processes  

output  

Quality Management (System)  

underlying principles  

underlying values  

using criteria (standards & indicators)  

transformation
Underlying principles & values

- Leading with vision, inspiration and integrity by leaders acting as a role model for their values and ethics (responsibility, people management…)
- Managing through structured and strategically aligned processes using fact-based decision making
- Integrated system interconnecting all processes and measuring their performances;
- Trust in continuous improvement;
- Succeeding by people who are valued in culture of empowerment for balanced achievement of organisational and personal goals (democracy)
mission (E/R/SS)

LO of input

influenced by
development

influence
development

phase

results

achieved LO

input

institution’s strategy

study programme

using criteria (standards & indicators)

Quality Management (System)

underlying principles

underlying values

methodology

tool
tool
tool
tool
tool
# Q(A) development phases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>management &amp; processes</th>
<th>results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Q is result of individual commitment</td>
<td>Q is variable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Beginning or thinking in processes</td>
<td>Q is result of start of systematic approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Organisation is managed professionally</td>
<td>Q is guaranteed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Organisation &amp; management are systematically renewed</td>
<td>Q is continuously improved with innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Organisation is outward-oriented &amp; strives towards excellence</td>
<td>Q is recognized by externals as excellent international example</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Paradigm shift in concept of Q & QA(M)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>early opinions</th>
<th>new views</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality is absolute and fixed</td>
<td>Q is relative &amp; multi-layered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One standard is dominant...</td>
<td>QA has many aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&amp; determined by the producer</td>
<td>Starting point = customers’ needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The final product is central...</td>
<td>Service is vital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and should be inspected</td>
<td>Q = result of processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality requirements are fixed</td>
<td>Q requirements change &amp; raise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality control by quality unit</td>
<td>Q = everybody’s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# QA checklist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What are you trying to achieve?</td>
<td>PURPOSES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why are you doing it?</td>
<td>REASON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How are you doing it?</td>
<td>METHOD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why is that the best way to do it?</td>
<td>OPTIMISATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do you know it works?</td>
<td>EFFECTIVENESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How can you improve it?</td>
<td>IMPROVEMENT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Peter Williams
“You shouldn’t value what you measure, but you should measure what you value.”

(Headgraves)
• Traditional mission of HE: education | research | social services
• Modern formulation: teaching & learning continuum of modes of research social impact
• Future mission of HE?
  Co-creating Community in progress & process LL learner’s centred L of competencies international or creativity network for innovation strategic network of co-creation
from vision to mission

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>vision</th>
<th>mission</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• the desired future WHERE</td>
<td>HOW you will get WHERE you want to be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• the FUTURE purposes &amp; values</td>
<td>PRIMARY purposes &amp; objectives related to your STAKEHOLDERS’ needs &amp; desires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Where do we AIM to be?</td>
<td>What do we DO? What makes us different?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
from vision & mission to strategy

future

vision

mission

WHO
- who are we?
- do we want to be?

WHERE
- where do we want to be active?

Which ACTIVITIES?

WHAT
- what do we want to reach for our stakeholders?

OBJECTIVES & STRATEGY

HOW
- how do we want to reach our objectives?

HOW
- how do we want to deal with our situation?

VALUES, BELIEFS & CULTURE

HOW
- how do we want to deal with ourselves?

Have our activities changed?

Do we need a new strategy?

Has our situation & culture changed?

WHO are we? do we want to be?
WHERE do we want to be active?
Which ACTIVITIES?

WHAT do we want to reach for our stakeholders?
OBJECTIVES & STRATEGY

HOW do we want to reach our objectives?

HOW do we want to deal with our situation?

VALUES, BELIEFS & CULTURE

Have our activities changed?

Do we need a new strategy?

Has our situation & culture changed?
Strategy tells us the means by which vision & mission could be achieved

mission (E/R/SS)    institution’s strategy    results

LO of input        study programme        achieved LO

input ➔ processes ➔ output

transformation

influenced by development

influence development phase

using criteria (standards & indicators)

Quality Management (System)

underlying principles

underlying values

methodology

tool tool tool tool tool tool

underlying values
• QA methodology & tools

Kaplan & Norton’s scorecard

Tools to measure: quantitative & qualitative data, KPI analysis, consensus meetings...
“PHE is a form of Higher Education that offers a particularly intense integration with the world of work in all its aspects, including teaching, learning, research and governance and at all levels of the overarching Qualifications Framework of the European Higher Education Area” (HAPHE definition)

Rather a continuum in ways of teaching and learning, research and governance
• **Policy & strategy of PHE :** (PHExcel)
• Institutional policies and strategies are defined in collaboration with all stakeholders and through engagement with relevant professional regulatory bodies and political authorities.
• The policy and strategy drives structural involvement with the world of work and wider society.
• The policy and strategy drives an active and long-term engagement with the community.
• The work environment is fully supportive of research and innovation and rewards these wherever they emerge in the institution.
• Policy & strategy objectives & outcomes of PHE:

The objectives and outcomes of the policies on teaching and learning, and research and innovation have a clear focus upon the needs and future developments of the world of work and wider society.

Institutional objectives and outcomes focus on the development of skills and competencies that enhance employability, the societal contribution and personal development of graduates.

The structural and systematic synergy with the world of work is realised in the outcomes impacting on teaching and research staff as well as in the staff and organisational development.

Institutions develop and maintain structural community partnerships.
After the meeting they realized the new manager suffered from severe adaptive difficulty.
Learning outcome (LO) : statement of what a learner is expected to know, understand and/or be able to do at the end of a period of learning (ECTS, not Tuning)

Competence(y) : the measurable performance of the ability to integrate knowledge, skills and attitude to function successfully in (a) particular context(s)
• **Intended LO**: statement of what a learner is expected to know, understand and/or be able to do at the end of a period of learning (ECTS, not Tuning)

• **Achieved LO**: the degree of achievement of the intended LO proved by (an) appropriate assessment(s)
IQA manual

LOs & QFs

LO of input  

study programme  

achieved LO

intended LO

input  

processes  

output

transformation

input

output

quality management (system)

underlying principles

underlying values

methodology

using criteria (standards & indicators)

influenced by
development

influence development phase
• **QF EHEA**: Bergen, 2005

• 3 cycles: short cycle within, Ba, Ma, PhD

• LO (Dublin) descriptors: knowledge, application in abilities, communication, learning skills

• Education systems, handbooks & ECTS

• NQFs

• QA
• **EQF (LLL)**: European Parliament, 2008

• 8 levels after compulsory education
• Knowledge, skills & (discerning) competences in responsibility & autonomy
• Formal, non-formal & informal learning
• NQFs
• more generic
• 6, 7 & 8 compatible with QF EHEA
• QA
## 21st c. LO or competences

(ability to integrate knowledge, skills and attitudes to come to solutions in specific contexts)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competence</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Teamwork skills</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Sector-specific skills</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Communication skills</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Computer skills</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ability to adapt &amp; act in new situations</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Good reading/writing skills</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Analytical &amp; problem-solving skills</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Decision-making skills</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Good with numbers</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Foreign language skills</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gallup for DG Education & Culture (2010)
study programme design

### Congruence between Learning (O) & Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LO</th>
<th>T &amp; L Forms</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive</td>
<td>Demonstrate, Knowledge, Comprehension, Application, Analysis, Synthesis, Evaluation</td>
<td>lecture, tutorials, discussions, laboratory, clinical work, seminar, peer group, presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affective</td>
<td>Integration of beliefs, ideas &amp; attitudes</td>
<td>clinical work, seminar, peer group, presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychomotor</td>
<td>Acquisition of physical skills</td>
<td>overall assessment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Kennedy (2007)
How (much) do we learn?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>%</th>
<th>comes from…</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>… what we read</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20%</td>
<td>… what we hear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>… what we see</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40%</td>
<td>… what we read &amp; see</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50%</td>
<td>… what we see &amp; hear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60%</td>
<td>… what we see, hear &amp; read</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70%</td>
<td>… what we have been able to talk about</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80%</td>
<td>… what we have practically done &amp; applied in real life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95%</td>
<td>… what we have taught to others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ESG 1.3 (2015) : Student-centred learning, teaching & assessment

- Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and
- the assessment of students reflects this approach.
QA & course design

1. Identify aims & objectives
2. Write LOs using guidelines
3. Develop a teaching & learning strategy to enable students to achieve the LOs
4. Design assessment method to test if LOs have been achieved
5. If necessary modify module content & Assessment in light of feedback

Duclan Kennedy (2007)
IQA manual
QA on programme & course level

(employers)

(parent)

alumni

commitment
learning
talent
activity

learner

LO
QUALITY

didactic
practice
professionalism
HRM policy

teacher

learning
environment

resources & design

atmosphere

HEI leaders & management

subject & educational experts

educational experts
- **PHE teaching & learning (PHExcel)**

  ✓ Curricula are systematically developed, reviewed and sustained in a **strategic collaboration with stakeholders** (the world of work, students and staff members), taking into consideration future, local and international contexts.

  ✓ Curricula and world of work inform and enhance each other mutually and dynamically.

  ✓ Curricula development is informed by **research in collaboration with the professions**.

  ✓ The **world of work is structurally integrated** in every aspect of the learning design and its implementation.
• PHE teaching & learning (PHExcel)

✓ The essential LO is a professional who is able to contribute to the profession in an innovative way.

✓ The learning content is productively integrating theory and practice through examples, cases, problem- & project-based learning, latest research or trends and references from both perspectives, the world of work and academia.

✓ Learning outcomes and assessment methodology are in line with the various professional and personal needs of different profiles of learners, including lifelong learners.
• PHE teaching & learning (PHExcel)
  ✔ The learning environment inspires, supports and practises learning in the world of work.

  ✔ The learning environment enables both learners and staff to move in and out of the professional environment.

  ✔ The team engages with and is informed by the latest international research, trends and references from both perspectives, the world of work and academia.

• Research
• Social impact
• Policy and Strategy
What is quality management?
Elements of quality culture (EUA)

Figure 3: Elements of quality culture (adapted from EUA 2006: 20 and EUA 2005: 18)

- Formal quality assurance processes
- Tools and processes to define, measure, evaluate, assure, and enhance quality
- Quality commitment
- Cultural element
- Individual level: personal commitment to strive for quality
- Collective level: individual attitudes and awareness add up to culture

Quality Culture

Communication
Participation
Trust
Quality Culture

Structural-formal elements

Organisational-psychological elements

Collective

Individual

Trust

Leadership
Communication
Participation
Collaboration

Shared values

Normative
Strategic
Operative

Commitment
Responsibility
Engagement

Sattler, Götzen & Sonntag (EQAF 2013), University of Heidelberg
Q culture is part of an organisation’s culture focusing on continuous enhancement of quality and thus living in deeper attitudes and values that are directing towards a continuing improvement. There are both structural-formal and organisational-psychological elements shaping it. Essential elements are leadership, communication, participation and commitment. Essential attitudes are openness, constructive criticism, objectiveness, systematics, problem-solving, innovativeness and collectiveness.
## Quality outcome/result

The relationship between QA, QC & Q is dialectic.
Characteristics of good IQA(s) (1)

- It’s all about quality, stupid!
- Quality is the essence & goal
- QA systems & management are only tools with underlying principles & values
- Qculture is the ultimate guarantee of Q
- QA systems are no tricks or games, they are not easy
- QA systems should be congruent with the Q culture & vision on quality
• Characteristics of good IQA(s) (2)

• QA systems are needed internally (IQA) & externally (EQA) (to meet)
• TQM : from vision, mission & strategy through processes towards results
• TQM : all activities (education, research & social impact) with appropriate commitment of all internal & external stakeholders…
• but prioritize to start implementation
• Characteristics of good IQA(S) (3)

• **BUT** TQM from mission & strategy should not only be a tool for the lead to measure the realisation or to adopt the strategic plan!

• Focus on the quality & continuous improvement

• of education, research & social impact themselves
• Characteristics of good IQA(s) (4)

• QA systems need commitment from everybody & systematic methodology starting from vision, mission & strategy into SMART objectives & plans shared by all stakeholders & monitored (PDCA) towards the best realisation

• QA should be transparent, inspiring, objective, collective, and critical, making choices in everyday processes & focussed on enhancement
• Characteristics of good IQA(s) (4)
• QA systems need commitment from everybody & systematic methodology starting from vision, mission & strategy into SMART objectives & plans shared by all stakeholders & monitored (PDCA) towards the best realisation
• QA should be transparent, inspiring, objective, collective, and critical, making choices in everyday processes & focussed on enhancement
• Characteristics of good IQA(s) (5)

• Use the appropriate standards & indicators telling something informative

• Mix quantitative & qualitative data

• Focus on learning & assessment activities by using a mixture of attractive learning formats mutually congruent with assessment formats
Characteristics of good IQA(s) (6)

- Formulate intended LOs taking into consideration input LOs
- Formulate LO linked with QF EHEA, EQF, NQF, HEI LO (mission), discipline LO, LO of study programme & course units (MOOCs)
- Achieve intended LOs via appropriate learning processes & assessment
- **BUT** not in a mechanistic way, make them living in the learning & assessment community, activities & formats
• Good IQA(s) (specifically PHE) (6bis)
• Bring in the world of work in strategy & policy, governance, education, research and social impact as deep as possible
• Engage representatives of the world of work with a long term vision
• Focus on the (inter)national future of professions
• Combine generic competencies with LLL
• Characteristics of good IQA(s) (7)
• **TAKE YOUR TIME FOR Q & QA**
  ✓ TIME TO ANALYSE CRITICALLY
  ✓ TIME TO THINK
  ✓ TIME TO LEARN
  ✓ TIME TO REALIZE TOGETHER
  ✓ TIME TO IMPLEMENT
  ✓ TIME TO ANALYSE
  ✓ TIME TO LEARN FROM YOUR FAILURES
• Characteristics of good IQA(s) (8)
• BELIEVE IN THE MANAGERIALNESS OF THE ORGANISATION
• START WITH INSPIRING LEADING
• BELIEVE IN THE DEMOCRATIC (EM)POWER(MENT) OF PEOPLE
• LEARN COLLECTIVELY FROM MISTAKES & FAILURES
• QA IS A LONG AND WINDING, BOTH STRUCTURAL & CULTURAL ROAD
To explore how internal & external QA processes may stimulate or hinder creativity & innovative practices in higher education.

© Patrick Sanders
A Manual of Internal Quality Assurance in Higher Education

with a special focus on professional higher education

Lucien Bollard

EURASHE
thanks

Q & A

l.bollaert@nvaon.net